Notification sent to all ward councillors, transport spokespeople, emergency services, Living Streets, Spokes, RNIB, Edinburgh Access Panel and relevant Community Councils on 24<sup>th</sup> November 2020. Recipients were given 10 days to respond with comments. The measures would be implemented under emergency delegated decision-making powers using a Temporary Traffic Regulation Order. Given the urgent nature of these works, normal expectations about community consultations cannot be fulfilled.

### **Project Proposal**

Location	Justification	Recommendation
Greenbank	This scheme proposes to create a safe cycling route between the south of the city and	It is recommended that the scheme is
to	the city centre, as well as providing a safe way to walk and cycle to school for several	delivered with the following
Meadows	primary schools and one high school. It also improves options for safe cycling to	modifications, in line with the
Quiet	Astley Ainslie Hospital. To achieve this, modal filters (where the street is closed to	attached plan:
Route	vehicular traffic) are proposed at the following locations:	The two closures at the northern end of Whitehouse Loan will be removed,
	<ul> <li>Canaan Lane north of the Astley Ainslie hospital access;</li> </ul>	and replace with one closure,
	<ul> <li>Whitehouse Loan immediately south of the junction with Strathearn Road;</li> </ul>	between Warrender Park Road and
	<ul> <li>Whitehouse Loan immediately south of the junction with Bruntsfield Crescent;</li> </ul>	Bruntsfield Crescent.
	and	
	<ul> <li>Whitehouse Loan immediately north of the junction with Warrender Park Road.</li> </ul>	

### **Feedback**

Comment	Comment	Response
from		
Cllr Feedbac	sk	
Cllr Melanie Main	I am very pleased to see the Quiet Route being brought forward it will support families and residents to travel sustainably around the ward, into the city centre and south Edinburgh. The route also provide much needed improved safety for children at pickup and drop off time at schools, allowing for safe social distancing and necessary measures that schools are following during the ongoing pandemic.  I have a few specific comments	Noted.
Cllr Melanie Main	. Overwhelmingly the emails and comments I have received have been in support, and in particularly parents travelling to and from schools along the route: Primary and Secondary schools including	

	South Morningside, St Peter's, James Gillespies', Bruntsfield, Boroughmuir and Steiners.	
Cllr Melanie Main	The route will help to improve safety South Morningside campus on Canaan Lane, and the Modal Filter that in shown on the indicative map is very welcome, although it is not clear that this is new, as there is nothing in place at present. Outside the schools (both St Peters (50% in last travel survey) and South Morningside pupils use Canaan Lane), the pavements are narrow as is the road and currently it is neither safe for pedestrians passing or families trying to remain at safe distances. It will require giving access to the West section of Canaan Lane from Morningside Road, which is not clearly shown on the map.	The proposed modal filter on Canaan Lane as part of this project is the one located to the North of the Astley Ainslie Hospital. It is understood that a separate intervention is in place on Canaan Lane to the West of Woodburn Terrace and this has been reflected in the drawings.
Cllr Melanie Main	There are a few residents who have raised concern about the modal filters on Whitehouse Loan and in particular the one that in North of Warrendar Park Road. Most of these relate to driver inconvenience, which must be weighted up against taking emergency measures in the short term for the safety of the pupils and residents which must at this point take precedence. Crossing Whitehouse Loan at Warrendar Park Road, which has been notably busy throughout shutdown and the pandemic at all times of day will be much safer: Bruntsfield Links will become a welcoming quiet place. The modal filter will discourage drivers from Warrendar Park Road which is a recognised rat run at present. There is concern from a few residents that traffic will be displaced onto Warrendar Park Crescent and I would ask that this is monitored and LOCAL ACCESS ONLY signs are installed in the crescent.	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Cllr Melanie Main	The modal filters in the Cluny area have been removed from this version of the Quiet Route. These would have made the area quieter and safer both for the QR and for residents and I would ask that the inclusion of these is included in forthcoming reviews once the scheme has bedded in. Braid Crescent has always suffered as a rat run and the modal filter on Braid Road would have helped quieten the route which is one used by children walking to South Morningside Primary.	We will monitor these locations and consider further interventions if required as part of a project review.

Cllr Melanie Main	It is important that there is good signage that can be followed along the route, not just the route itself but destinations along the route including schools but also Midmar Paddock, Blackford, Hermitage, Morningside and Bruntsfield High Streets, and Public Toilets.	We will introduce signage along the route, however, given the temporary nature of the intervention, it is unlikely that we will be able to sign all relevant nearby locations.
Cllr Melanie Main	This is a project that really will make a difference to local people and allow them to travel as they are being asked to do during this pandemic for their health and safety, using sustainable methods of walking, cycling and wheeling. I very much support it.	Noted.
Cllr Neil Ross	Need for public consultation before implementation	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.
Cllr Neil Ross	I propose that the Route for cyclists FROM the Meadows uses Braid Avenue and not Hermitage Gardens; the stop signs at the junction with Hermitage Drive would give cyclists priority to turn right.  Cyclists going towards the Meadows would use a different road as planned - Hermitage Gardens. Before turning into Hermitage Gardens, cyclists have to travel one block along Hermitage Drive. Nobody has mentioned parking, and to accommodate cycle lanes both ways parking needs to be banned there. Unfortunately, this is precisely where visitors to the Hermitage are parking because Braid Road is closed.	The southbound route utilises Hermitage Gardens in order to reduce the amount of time users will spend going continuously uphill. However, any cyclists who wish to use Braid Ave instead, may still do so.  There are no cycle lanes planned on this section which will involve on-carriageway cycling, as such parking is unaffected. The viability of cycling on carriageway will be reviewed regularly and should the level of traffic become too high further measures may be considered, but are not currently proposed.
Cllr Neil Ross	The proposed Greenbank to Meadows cycle route runs along Cluny Drive. Since Braid Road was closed this has become a rat run for traffic seeking to avoid Morningside Station traffic lights. Can you arrange to count the traffic levels here and consider temporary traffic calming measures?	We will consider whether any changes are required at this location as part of the first project review.
Cllr Neil Ross	Has consideration been given to the use of extendable road barriers that could apply during school pick up/drop off times only?	Yes this has been considered. However they are not proposed as:

Cllr Neil Ross	If the main reason is to improve road safety for pupils going to and from school, could extendable barriers be used instead of immovable barriers?  2. Warrender Park Crescent is a one-way street that runs from East to West. Under the proposals, residents of this street, when making journeys by car, could only turn northwards out of their road and then, to return home, would have a two mile journey via Bruntsfield Place, Chamberlain Road, Strathearn Road, Whitehouse Loan, Thirlestane Road and Marchmont Street to return home. Or alternatively, a one and a half mile detour via Home Street, Tollcross, Melville Drive, Marchmont Road and Warrender Park	<ul> <li>They are only in effect at certain times of day – it is important that the route is available at off-peak, as well as peak times.</li> <li>They are prohibitively expensive due to the need to place/remove the barriers each day.</li> <li>It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed</li> </ul>
	Terrace. As there are over a hundred homes in Warrender Park Crescent, the extra mileage needed for residents to go round and round in circles will make main routes more congested, increase air pollution and will impact on neighbours elsewhere in Marchmont. If the modal filter, proposed for just to the north of the junction with Warrender Park Road, was moved to the south of this junction, it would still keep the road closed to through traffic and improve road safety for pupils and parents outside the school. Has this been considered?	further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Cllr Neil Ross	3. The placement of the filters at Warrender Park Road and Strathearn Road effectively block the road to through traffic potentially making the Bruntsfield Crescent filter redundant so why is it still necessary?	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Cllr Neil Ross	4. If the filter at Bruntsfield Crescent is still deemed necessary, it will force all traffic into and out of Bruntsfield Crescent to go past the primary school. There was a recent accident involving a car and damage to a bollard and guardrail just outside the school on	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter,

	Whitehouse Loan. To remove this road safety concern, could the filter be moved just to the north of the junction with Bruntsfield Crescent?	between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Cllr Neil Ross	5. Cluny Drive is part of this cycle route. It is normally a quiet, residential street but now, because Braid Road is closed, it is dangerous. Traffic levels and speeds have greatly increased in order to avoid the lights at Morningside Station and the long and slow-moving queues on Comiston Road, particularly between 6.30 am and 9.00 am and from about 4.00 pm to 6.30 pm. As part of the assessment and review of the closure of Braid Road, will traffic counts be carried out on roads directly affected by the closure in addition to Comiston Road, such as Cluny Drive, Comiston Place and Terrace, Braid Crescent, Braidburn Crescent and Braidburn Terrace, where traffic often goes along from east to west against the one-way system?	Traffic counts have not – to date – been carried out at this location as part of the monitoring of the Braid Road closure.  We will consider whether any changes are required at this location as part of the first project review.
Cllr Neil Ross	6. Some cyclists use the main roads near to this route, such as Strathearn Place and Road, Morningside Road and Marchmont Road. These roads are likely to have increased vehicular traffic displaced from Whitehouse Loan and Canaan Lane making them potentially more dangerous for cyclists. What consideration has been given to cycling on these roads and what measures can be introduced to improve road safety?	It is unlikely that any displacement from Whitehouse Loan onto these roads will be of a magnitude which would meaningfully affect the risk posed to people cycling on them. Nonetheless, Morningside Road has been subject to changes as part of the Town Centre interventions within Spaces for People, which has included the introduction of wider footways, and segregated cycleways at certain points.
Cllr Neil Ross	7. One of the major factors that puts people off cycling in Edinburgh is the poor condition of some of the roads as potential cyclists fear falling into a pothole or being destabilised by a broken or uneven road surface with the attendant risk of falling off their bike. On this route, the surfaces of Canaan Lane, between Woodburn Terrace and Newbattle Terrace, Braid Avenue, Cluny Drive and Braidburn Terrace are in poor condition. What consideration has been given to the full or partial resurfacing of these roads and when is the work to be done?	No specific consideration of resurfacing on these roads has taken place. However we will consider whether this would be required or appropriate moving forward as part of the review process for this project.

Cllr Neil Ross	8. Does the Council plan to inform local residents and businesses in close proximity to the route of the proposals? If it does, will this be in writing and in advance of implementation?	There are no dedicated communications with local residents and businesses planned.
Cllr Neil Ross	9,What advance warning will be given to vehicle drivers of the restrictions on Whitehouse Loan and Canaan Lane? Will this include prominent signage at appropriate locations to allow drivers to change their route without having to carry out three point turns? Will adequate notification be given to sat-nav operators and sources of direction finding, location and mapping services online?	Signage will be in place warning of the closures well in advance.
Cllr Neil Ross	10. As this cycle route is to be implemented on a temporary basis, what assessment criteria will be used to measure its success or otherwise? Will these measurements be of accident statistics, volume and types of journeys (pedestrian, cyclist and vehicular), air pollution statistics and the volume and nature of feedback to the Council? In addition to on the route itself, will these assessments be carried out on main roads near to the route, such as Morningside Road, Strathearn Road and Kilgraston Road? How will a meaningful comparison be made with conditions prevailing before implementation? How and by whom will those measurements be made and recorded and over what time period? Will the assessments be reported to the Council's Transport and Environment Committee and, if so, when?	The success of the scheme will be assessed on the basis of it's use, as well as any impacts that it has on the wider network. This will be assessed alongside other projects as part of the monitoring plan for Spaces for People. This will not necessarily include dedicated assessment of adjacent routes in terms of traffic volume etc, however if such issues arise they will be monitored more closely.
Cllr Claire Miller	How do vehicles turn around to go back along Warrender Park Road if they have come to the end and can't go north or south on Whitehouse Loan?	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Cllr Claire Miller	Is there any provision to protect people on bikes from general traffic on this stretch of road ( from Canaan Lane to Grange)	Not as part of this proposal, however this can be considered as part of the projects ongoing review process.

Cllr Claire Miller	Will there be any changes here to make it safer to cycle across the crossroads at Braid Avenue	Not as part of this proposal, however this can be considered as part of the projects ongoing review process.
Cllr Claire Miller	How do people on bikes safely navigate this junction to enter Braidburn Terrace from the south or west from Greenbank Drive?	From the south there is a two-stage right turn box which allows right turning cyclists to turn across two stages and avoid waiting in the middle of moving traffic. From the West cyclists would travel across the junction with general traffic Later this year this junction will be re-built as part of a wider permanent project which will introduce
Cllr Steve Burgess	I support these measures to help pedestrians and cyclists travel safely while meeting physical distancing requirements.	a toucan crossing to allow for this movement.  Noted.
Cllr Scott Arthur	Point 1 I don't know anyone who seriously opposes the quiet route concept. It is clear, however, that many people living along the route have concerns about the detail of the design. It's disappointing that, in the eight months since lockdown began, more resources have not been made available to engage with residents living along the route. Indeed, there is no doubt that community engagement is important as it leads to improved outcomes on infrastructure projects. It increases acceptance of decisions as local knowledge from diverse groups shapes and creates inclusive, effective solutions.  Point 2 Creater acceptance of the scheme may be possible if the evidence base for it is shared. It's disappointing that in the eight months since lockdown began this has not happened.  Point 3	approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery. The intention behind this project is to provide a safe cycling route to and from the city centre from Greenbank as an alternative to Morningside Road, connecting with the cycle lanes on Comiston Road, as well as providing routes to local schools. This will be achieved by removing through traffic on key streets to enable safe
	The Fairmilehead area interfaces with two Spaces for People schemes – those on Buckstone/Pentland Terrace and Braid Road. These schemes have struggled to gain widespread public support due to (1) the lack of community engagement, (2) failure to share 3. the evidence base that justifies their existence and (3) the decision to view both of these as separate units. Pre-Covid, the need to better connect Morningside and Fairmilehead for those able to walk4. and cycle was clear. Rather than responding to the Covid crisis by working with the community to establish one good quality route we	cycling on the carriageway. Levels of traffic, and interacting with it is a key barrier to many people who do not cycle, but would like to. The council is aware of the inter-connected nature of these three interventions and is working on their planning and delivery accordingly. Full access to all properties along the route will be retained. Any further changes will be communicated through the same channels as the original proposals,

could all be proud of, the Council has stretched limited resources between two schemes and lost the trust of local residents. It is notable that many of those who signed the petition calling for the 5. This specific proposal will not focu reopening of Braid Road actually live on or near it. Indeed, it is only. now that data is being collected to understand how these schemes interoperate.

Within this context, I find the decision to view the (1) Quiet Route, (2) Braid Roads and (3) Buckstone/Pentland Terrace schemes separately as difficult to justify to residents in my Ward. If these schemes truly are to form a route for cyclists between Fairmilehead and the Meadows, there they should be viewed as one and residents should be consulted on the formation of a single coherent route which does not impact negatively on public transport or any local school.

#### Point 4

In terms of accessibility, many disabled people depend on cars (both to drive and as a passenger) and taxis. Road changes shouldn't prevent disabled people from being able to stop near their destination. Changes to usual travel patterns can add to anxiety for all of us, but to some disabled people in particular. The scheme should therefore be seen in this context - continual changes should therefore be avoided where possible, and should be effectively communicated to the public (including disabled people).

#### Point 5

Steps should be taken to remind residents along the route of the hazard parked cars and overgrown hedges (etc) pose to pedestrians and those with buggies/wheelchairs/guide dogs. This is particularly important on the streets surrounding the schools. ==+==

which includes engagement with groups representing those with visual and mobility impairments.

s on communication messages such as these, though the council does ask all users to be considerate through other channels, such as our Smarter Choices Smarter Places courtesy signage, and other interventions.

#### Cllr Jason Rust

- I am unclear as to what indicators are in place to assess success of this proposal. How will we all know what success looks like?
- I understand zero road accidents have been recorded on Whitehouse Loan in the last 5 years based on PACTS public
- The success of the scheme will be assessed on the basis of it's use, as well as any impacts that it has on the wider network. This will be assessed alongside other projects as part of the monitoring plan for Spaces for People. This will not necessarily include dedicated assessment of adjacent routes in terms of

dashboard.

- Has legal advice been sought in respect of the linkage of this scheme with the continued closure of Braid Road by TTRO?
- I am concerned that the closure of Braid Road is shown on the proposal as an Existing Modal Filter. This is incorrect, the road is currently temporarily closed, but there is the expectation that it will be reopened?
- I understand a number of representations/petitions have been submitted from residents in the Bruntsfield Crescent and Whitehouse Loan stretch and hope these will be taken into account?
- Not my ward, but I do know residents in the locale and blocking Whitehouse loan on either side of Warrender Park Rd will I assume increase the through traffic on Warrender Park Crescent and WP Terrace and Thirlestane Rd? Both these roads are narrower and less suitable for traffic than Warrender Park Rd. The Terrace is also cobbled and currently a quiet residential street.

- traffic volume etc, however if such issues arise they will be monitored more closely.
- This scheme is intended to encourage more people to cycle. We know that the requirement to interact with moving traffic is a key barrier to those who do not cycle, but would like to, regardless of whether accidents have taken place.
- No Legal Advice related to the linkage between these two interventions has been sought. Legal Advise regarding the Spaces for People scheme has been clear that for an intervention to utilise TTRO legislation the Roads Authority must be satisfied that doing so addresses a risk of impact on public health in relation to the Covid-19 epidemic.
- Showing Braid Road as an 'Existing Modal Filter'
  does not prejudice it's re-opening in the future. It
  merely sets the context for this proposal. At such a
  time as Braid Road is re-opened, that context
  changes, and further interventions may be required
  to ensure that the Quiet Route outlined in this
  proposal remains effective.
- These have been considered and on the basis of these submissions It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
- See above.

Community Council

Carol Duncan – Many thanks for the opportunity to comment on the proposed emergency 'Quiet Route' from Greenbank to the Meadows.

The support is noted.

T		
Morningsid e Communit y Council	We circulated the proposal to over 90 residents and the nominated representatives of Morningside Community Council.  It is clear the Quiet Route is strongly supported by residents.	<ol> <li>We will consider whether any changes are required at this location as part of the first project review.</li> <li>The proposed modal filter on Canaan Lane as part of this project is the one located to the North of the</li> </ol>
response	However, a number of specific concerns were raised with us and we would appreciate your further consideration of these.  1. Hermitage Gardens to Cluny Drive: can a protected right turn be	Astley Ainslie Hospital. It is understood that a separate intervention is in place on Canaan Lane to the West of Woodburn Terrace and this has been reflected in the drawings.  3. Should any significant issues arise these will be
	installed? This is now a busy junction for traffic avoiding the traffic lights at the Clock.	considered during project review.  4. While many of the journeys on Morningside Road by bike might reasonably be made on the quiet route,
	2. Canaan Lane: We support a modal filter on Canaan Lane at the Deanbank annexe to South Morningside School. On the map this filter is marked as 'existing' but this is incorrect. Concern was also expressed about vehicles going onto the pavement at the Morningside Road entrance to Canaan Lane, when children are going back and forth to school.	there will be many other journeys which are travelling to/from destinations for which the quiet route would not be suitable, especially locations on, and to the west of Morningside Road. As such, we will not be encouraging cyclists to <i>not</i> use Morningside Road.
	3. Woodburn Terrace: Concern for the safety of cyclists on Woodburn terrace during pick up/ drop of times at the primary schools.	
	4. Morningside Road: if the Quieter Route is to be safer for cyclists, then it is suggest cyclists are positively encouraged to use this route rather than Morningside Road.	
Marchmon	We strongly support the proposal on the section north of Cluny	The support is noted.
t and Sciennes Communit	Gardens. We have no comments to make about the section to the south.	Introducing segregated cycleways on Whitehouse Loan between Strathearn Road and Newbattle Terrace would
y Council	We believe that any proposal which benefits walking and cycling over motor transport in the city centre is a good thing.	require removal of significant amounts of parking in one of the most over-subscribed parking zones. It would also be difficult at the narrower section immediately before
	There is a VERY strong need to reduce motorists from executing 'rat runs' in otherwise quiet strrets as this significantly reduces the quality of lofe of the people living in these streets whereas putting	
	that traffic back onto a major route will have a tiny overall impact on that major route.	

		T
	The only detailed point that we wish to make is that a review of the block of Whitehouse Loan to the South of Strathearn Road. If, and only if, a completely segregated cycle lane could be employed there then it might not ne necessary to impose the block, again, so long as it doesn't then encourage a rat run there.	
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	1 These proposals have been on the drawing board since at least early 2018 if not earlier yet all of a sudden the Council are using Covid19 as an excuse to implement them.	These proposals have been developed specifically in response to the Covid-19 pandemic. Their similarity to previous ideas for development is not surprising as the need to provide safe routes for people to walk and cycle is an important part of the Council's response to the pandemic. It is also an important part of our overall transport strategy.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	2 On what legal basis are the proposals being implemented. It appears that the Council may be acting ultra viries.	These proposals are being implemented utilising TTRO notices in line with guidance from the Scottish Government.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	We are concerned that the closure of Braid Road is shown on the proposal as an existing modal filter. This is incorrect as the road is temporarily closed and is under constant review to be reopened.	Showing Braid Road as an 'Existing Modal Filter' does not prejudice it's re-opening in the future. It merely sets the context for this proposal. At such a time as Braid Road is re-opened, that context changes, and further interventions may be required to ensure that the Quiet Route outlined in this proposal remains effective.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	4 The original proposals for Braid Road which were underway until the lockdown in March, saw the removal of the mini roundabout at Braid Road/ Braidburn Terrace/ Hermitage Drive.	These proposals are still under final development and they will be implemented this year.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	5 The closure of the north part of Canaan Lane (from Astley Ainslie to Newbattle Terrace) is unnecessary. This section is already one way southwards for motor vehicles with a contraflow cycle lane and works perfectly well. There are also speed bumps on the whole of Canaan Lane	This closure is required to reduce north-south through traffic on key parts of the route to the south of Canaan Lane including Woodburn Terrace and Braid Avenue.

Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	6 The closure of Whitehouse Loan at Strathearn Road is also unnecessary. The south part of Strathearn Road is very wide.	This closure is required to remove through traffic and create a safe one street cycling environment for users of all ages and abilities. Road width alone does not provide a safe cycling environment.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	There is no need to close the northern part of Whitehouse Loan outside the school. All that is necessary are the flashing lights signs used at other school street sites such as at St Peters RC Primary. Such signs should only be operative at school drop off and pick up times.	These signs are permanent installations which take significant planning and only operate at peak times. It is important that the route provides a safe route for users during off-peak times also.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	8 According to my research there have been no recorded vehicle accidents in the last 5 years on Whitehouse Loan.	This scheme is intended to encourage more people to cycle. We know that the requirement to interact with moving traffic is a key barrier to those who do not cycle, but would like to, regardless of whether accidents have taken place.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	9 Due to the closure of Whitehouse Loan at the school how are residents of Bruntsfield Crescent supposed to access their properties?	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	The alternative routes around the closure in the north part of Whitehouse Loan are unsuitable as divisionary routes are through residential streets some of which are cobbled. In fact one, Warrender Park Terrace at the west end is one way.	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed

		further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Norman Tinlin Fairmilehe ad Communit y Council	11 What indicators are in place to monitor and assess the proposals.	This proposal will be monitored as part of the overall Spaces for People monitoring plan.
Stakeholder	Feedback	
Dr Andrew Watson Associate Medical Director, NHS Lothian	I would like to offer our full support on behalf of the senior management team for the proposed quiet route from Greenbank to. Safe cycling routes are key way for us to support travel to/from the hospital without seeing a dramatically increased demand for parking. Linking the Meadows/Brunstfield links cycle paths with Morningside via the safe route / Cannan lane would substantially enhance the ability of people to cycle safely to the site. A further aspiration would be a cycle friendly way to cross Morningside Road at the end of Cannan Lane onto either Millar Crescent or Morningside Park. That would allow people to fully access the REH site safely and also use the network within the Hospital to travel over to Myreside Road. But in the short term the Greenbank to Meadows route would offer substantial benefits itself and we fully support it.	The support is noted.  A crossing at this location is unlikely to be deliverable as part of the Spaces for People Programme. However, it is something that the Council may be able to consider in the longer term.
RNIB policy response	A Coronavirus Courtesy Code should be promoted to enable safe social distancing for all road users. We would be happy to work with others on its development to make sure all pedestrians and road users:  • Keep safe and keep 2 metres apart  • Be aware that not all disabilities, including sight loss, are visible  • Work together to ensure everyone can use our roads and paths  2. Preference must be given to allocating extra space for cyclists from the road, not from the pavement space.  3. Any signage indicating any new pop-up cycle lanes should be placed on the road/cycle lane, not on the pavement.  4. Shared space between cyclists and pedestrians must be avoided. Blind and partially sighted pedestrians find it extremely difficult to detect cycles, whilst cyclists may not realise that a pedestrian has	<ol> <li>This is not within the scope of this particular proposal, however the Council are working to ensure that a clear message encouraging all road and path users to consider other users, including those with mobility and visual impairments.</li> <li>No footway spaces is being utilised for cycling as part of this proposal.</li> <li>Signage will be placed so as to minimise impact on all users, and where possible placement on footways will be avoided.</li> <li>No Shared Use areas are proposed, though people walking and cycling may both use the carriageway.</li> <li>There are no changes to kerbs.</li> <li>There are no changes to crossings.</li> </ol>

Robin Wickes	sight loss. Mobility aids such as white canes can get caught up bicycle wheels, which is a further hazard to both.  5. While retaining dropped kerbs at crossings for wheelchair users, kerbs should be kept allowing visually impaired people to safely find the pavement edge.  6. Existing controlled crossings should be maintained.  7. Warning markings and signs must also be provided to instruct cyclists to stop when pedestrians are near or on the formal crossing.  8. Many existing bus stops are inaccessible to people with sight loss if these must be reached across cycle lanes - new bus stop arrangements introduced under the scheme must be accessible to the visually impaired.  We welcome this "Morningside bypass for cyclists" provided it doesn't cause unacceptable additional congestion and pollution on	7. There are no changes to crossings. 8. There are no changes to bus stops.  Impact on surrounding routes will be considered should this become a problem. The level of traffic on the
Access Panel	Morningside Road and Comiston Road as motorists use those roads instead of the ones dedicated to cyclists. We assume the reason you have proposed restrictions to Whitehouse Loan, Canaan Lane etc is because the high volume of traffic using them makes them unsafe for cyclists. We are therefore concerned about the consequences of adding this high volume to the already high volume on Morningside Road. Please take care to analyse the traffic numbers before you proceed and to monitor them after proceeding.  Your map indicates that the road closures do not apply to walkers, wheelers and cyclists. It's clearly essential that there's easy access for residents and emergency/delivery/recycling vehicles too. In addition please ensure there's easy access for blue badge holders and taxis.  We assume you are expecting significant numbers of cyclists to use	affected streets is high enough to be off-putting for people who don't cycle but would like to, but is not so high as to be expected to have a significant impact on the surrounding network. We work with partners to monitor this.  All premises will still be accessible by vehicle.  We expect the cyclists using this route to number in the hundreds per day, which should not pose a great difficulty for those hoping to cross the road.
	this quiet route. Please ensure there are adequate pedestrian crossings on it. Cyclists are (a) far less visible to pedestrians than vehicles and (b) far less likely than drivers to give way to pedestrians.	
Spokes South Edinburgh	The Council proposals provided are outlined as "modal filters (where the street is closed to vehicular traffic) are proposed at the following locations:	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the

	<ul> <li>Canaan Lane north of the Astley Ainslie hospital access;</li> <li>Whitehouse Loan immediately south of the junction with Strathearn Road;</li> <li>Whitehouse Loan immediately south of the junction with Bruntsfield Crescent; and</li> <li>Whitehouse Loan immediately north of the junction with Warrender Park Road."</li> </ul>	South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Greenbank Crossroads / Braidburn Terrace: As this is the Greenbank to Meadows Quiet Route, Spokes would like to see an improved connection to/from Greenbank. The cycle contraflow barriers should be redesigned to allow for left turning cyclist to proceed, without being forced to the right and into the path of late (right) turning oncoming traffic. The sequence of lights at Greenbank junction is counter intuitive and discourages use of the 2 stage right turn from Comiston Road.	We will review the left turning manoeuvre as outlined.  Later this year this junction will be re-built as part of a wider permanent project which will introduce a toucan crossing to allow for the right turning movement.
Spokes South Edinburgh	At peak times drivers turning right from Comiston Road are slow to clear sandwiching cyclists between them and the following vehicles from Greenbank Crescent.  This form of right turn is also difficult for bikes with a wide turning circle (e.g. cargobikes)consideration should be given to a permanent light sequence directly after N/S lights for a crossing for all pedestrians and cyclists  Braid Rd:  Spokes would like to note that the closure of this section of Braid Rd combined with the Braidburn Terrace one way (w/ cycle contraflow) has radically altered the amount of traffic and therefore quietness of the Cluny area. It is now common to see children independently walking, wheeling and cycling up and down this section.	Later this year this junction will be re-built as part of a wider permanent project which will introduce a toucan crossing to allow for the right turning movement.  Noted.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Hermitage Drive: We would like to see this and the surrounding streets remain as calm as they are now, rather than when compared with those prior to the Braid Road closure. If the Braid Closure modal filters or Braidburn Terrace one way with contraflow were to be removed. The level of segregation on Hermitage Drive would need to be	Noted.

	reassessed.	
Spokes South Edinburgh	Hermitage Gardens: Spokes SE is concerned that the previously proposed diagonal modal filter has been removed from the junction with Cluny Drive.	We will consider any required changes in this area as part of the project review.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Cluny Drive: Spokes notes that this has become a popular (east-west) rat running route since the recent gas works on Cluny Gardens. Therefore the diagonal modal filter would discourage this route for nonresidents and would encourage this to be reinstated on a trial basis	We will consider any required changes in this area as part of the project review.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Braid Avenue: When headed south (uphill) if cyclists are turning right onto Cluny Drive and there is no modal filter (on Braid Avenue or Hermitage Gardens junction) to prevent east west rat running it will be an added danger to navigate. Spokes SE would like to note that the surface condition along this is poor for cyclists and should be prioritised for resurfacing if possible. The Cluny Gardens traffic lights ASL's etc are very worn and in need of renewal as soon as possible.	We will consider any required changes in this area as part of the project review.  Re-surfacing will be considered also.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Woodburn Terrace: Spokes would like to note the surface condition is very poor on this stretch and would like it to be prioritised for resurfacing as soon as possible.	We will consider this moving forward.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Canaan Lane: Spokes supports the removal of through traffic on Canaan Lane (southbound) from Whitehouse Loan. The position of this new Modal Filter isn't clear but we assume it is north of the exit from the Royal Blind School. The "Existing Modal Filter" on the west section of the lane is a school street closure also under SfP.In its current form it is not a modal filter and allows vehicle access incl. construction vehicles. During recent gas works the road was fully closed to all but pedestrians and cyclists showing a real modal filter can work. Another area of concern is the west end which has an existing successful contraflow. From the proposal it is not clear if the west section will remain one way (with contraflow cycle lane) or be two	The proposed modal filter on Canaan Lane as part of this project is the one located to the North of the Astley Ainslie Hospital. It is understood that a separate intervention is in place on Canaan Lane to the West of Woodburn Terrace and this has been reflected in the drawings.  This modal filter will be subject to separate project reviews. These concerns will be fed back to the project lead.

Spokes South Edinburgh	way for vehicles. Spokes believes this increases conflict at the west end busy pavement beside the Canny Man's and should be avoided and remain exit only (with contraflow segregated bike lane). We would also like to note the surface condition is very poor throughout Canaan Lane and would like it to be prioritised for resurfacing as soon as possible.  Newbattle Terrace:  Spokes believes this could become the weakest link in the route if not filtered. The exit from Canaan Lane northbound is uphill and with restricted sight-lines. Also the planned public realm improvement scheme for the Pitsligo Rd junction needs to be taken into consideration which is also under consultation during the period of this consultation.	We will monitor the route on Newbattle Terrace and consider any changes as part of the project review.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Whitehouse Loan Spokes supports the installation of these modal filters on Whitehouse Loan outside James Gillespie PS & HS. In addition to its 24/7 safety benefits, this scheme will avoid the need for voluntary parent manned road closures to protect pupils. The barrier should be constructed of robust materials and designed appropriately for the setting. Hopefully this resolves the issue of conflicting left turning cyclists and right turning cars at the south end when headed north. However we would like to ensure there is no increased conflict of cars turning left into Clinton Rd over slower uphill cyclists if they cannot proceed north to Strathearn Rd.	Noted. It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Modal Filters: The modal filter proposed to each site needs to be considered to ensure it can't be adjusted by those not intended to use it, or bypassed by mounting the pavement adjacent (as has been recorded on several occasions at Braid Rd since closure) endangering pedestrians and nonmotorized traffic.  Spokes is concerned there are no detailed drawings provided for any of the proposed modal filters. We don't know if these will be assembled from planters, barriers, cones or bollards, and as the "Existing Modal Filters" which are basic traffic management	In the first instance these will be installed using traffic management equipment. However it is intended that these will be replaced with more fitting equipment moving forward.  Consideration will be given to appropriate signage alongside other similar schemes.

	materials (cones & barriers) which can be easily manipulated by those wishing to break through the filter. Spokes would encourage the use of clearer signage on any modal filters. For example simple "ROAD CLOSED" can be discouraging for walkers, wheelers & cyclists. Whereas "ROAD OPEN TO [ ] [ ] [ ] [ ] [ ] is better. The circular sign shown below is from the illustrative diagram of the Quiet Route proposal, so we presume you are intending to use this sign. However we suggest you should instead use a sign similar to that in the left-hand diagram, which is now in frequent use in London and becoming an informal standard (albeit there is an arguably better variant with the bike having a person on it).	
Spokes South Edinburgh	These filters should also be arranged so as not to force cyclists right (as is currently the case at the Braidburn Terrace) and into conflict with other users. There could also be road markings that can't be vandalised as easily as signage. The locations outside schools are also an opportunity for creative proposals that reflect the proximity and encouraging more pupils (& parents etc) to walk, wheel and cycle to school.	We will ensure that the road can be easily used by people on bikes.
Spokes South Edinburgh	Finally we would like to confirm that the modal filters will be designed to allow for the use of "non-standard" cycles. These are as per Edinburgh Street Design Guidance. As a route to schools it should enable cargo bike or bike trains.	We will ensure that the road can be easily used by people on non-standard bikes.
Public Comr	ment in support	
Blackford Safe Routes	- Blackford Safe Routes fully endorses the Quiet Route design	Noted.
Blackford Safe Routes	To discourage drivers from turning around at Bruntsfield Crescent when making school ndrop-offs, we propose two additional planters on Warrender Park Road just to the west of Marchmont Street which have "Local Access Only signage" (that will still allow traffic to enter/leave).	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also

		as part of a scheme review.
Blackford Safe Routes	Modal filters: - Should be attractive in construction, for example: wooden planters, symmetrical, natural in appearance, containing greenery. This is important so that we get community buy-in Should not consist of unattractive metal barriers or red plastic barriers, as they are likely to be rejected by the community.	In the first instance these will be installed using traffic management equipment. However it is intended that these will be replaced with more fitting equipment moving forward.
Blackford Safe Routes	- Should be substantial and solid enough to resist vandalism and/or being pushed over/moved Should have the green "Road open to walkers, wheelers, cycles" signs (see below) Should allow non-standard bicycle types to pass through e.g. cargo bikes, tandems, recumbents, tricycles, heavy bikes, trailers, hand-cycles and bicycles where the rider may not easily be able to dismount If they have a gap to allow emergency vehicle access, this gap must be enforced either by a lockable bollard or an ANPR camera system.	Consideration will be given to appropriate signage alongside other similar schemes.  We will ensure that the road can be easily used by people on bikes, including non-standard bikes.  Gaps are not proposed.
Blackford Safe Routes	School gate access by car:  - To discourage drivers from turning around at Bruntsfield Crescent when making school drop-offs or pick-ups, we propose two additional planters on Warrender Park Road just to the west of Marchmont Street which have "Local Access Only signage" (that will still allow traffic to enter/leave). We note that there are three alternative car drop-off locations, within 150m of the school gate, which would avoid the need for turning.	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Blackford Safe Routes	- With the modal filters in place on Whitehouse Loan, immediately North and immediately South of Warrender Park Road, we believe the current lollypop-controlled crossing point should be safe enough not to require a crossing patrol person. Therefore, there is the potential to move the lollypop person just to the west of Marchmont Street (where the proposed new	If it is found that the crossing patrol is not required then it is possible a relocation could be considered.

	planters are, as described above), to further discourage drivers from driving all the way up to the school gate.	
Blackford Safe Routes	Temporary arrangements before & during introduction:  - Temporary signs should be erected to give advance warning of the road closures, for example, one week before implementation.  - Google Maps, OpenStreetMaps, Ordinance Survey, Waze, Apple Maps and commercial sat-nav system providers should be given notification to update their maps with the closures. This notification should be made early enough and timed such that the maps are updated on or before the day the modal filters are in place.	<ul> <li>It is not proposed to erect signage in advance, though signs will be in place to provide motorists with warning before they reach the closure.</li> <li>Online mapping services and sat-nav providers will be made aware</li> </ul>
Blackford Safe Routes	Police presence should be provided on the first day of school on/after the opening day to guide drivers away from the filters. Ideally this should be maintained for one week at both morning and afternoon drop-off/pick-up.	The Council is not able to guarantee a police presence. The police will be notified of the proposed closures and we will work in partnership to respond to any issues that arise.
Blackford Safe Routes	- Temporary signs to guide drivers away from the filters should remain in place for a few weeks e.g. "No through road (except cycles)" or "Local access only".  Signage:	Signage will be in place throughout the lifetime of this intervention.
Blackford Safe Routes	The quiet route should have direction signs for cyclists/walkers using the small blue cycling signs and road marking arrows	Signage of this type will not be erected immediately in case there are changes to be made to the proposals, however we will review the project once it is in place and seek to ensure signage is implemented which provides a coherent route.
Blackford Safe Routes	Keeping the fundementals of the scheme as designed: It is very important that the scheme does not get watered down. Recently, an email was sent by a resident of Bruntsfield Crescent to ward councillors, asking for the number of modal-	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield

	filters on Whitehouse Loan to be reduced from three to one.	Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Blackford Safe Routes	It's useful to note that the resident already enjoys the benefits of living on a cul-de-sac and no-through-route to motor traffic - the Quiet Route would actually extend these benefits to a great number of people nearby.	Noted.
Blackford Safe Routes	We believe the Quiet Route has been designed as a kind of eco-system - picking and choosing elements of the design ends up breaking that eco-system. To reduce the number(and/or effectiveness) of the modal-filters would continue to allow streams of non-local, through-motor-traffic and therefore would not achieve modal-shift, nor safety for active travellers. In so doing, understanding the benefits of the trial becomes impossible to evaluate.	Noted. Once the scheme is implemented we will be able to monitor how it is working and consider any required changes.
Blackford Safe Routes	We also note that there was recently a car crash on Whitehouse Loan (on Saturday 28th November) where a bollard and guardrail were destroyed at the pedestrian crossing to Bruntsfield Links. See images below. Thankfully, the bollard took the brunt of the impact and not a child. It demonstrates that road-danger is ever-present and urgently needs to be tackled by reducing that danger at source, i.e. by reducing traffic.	Noted.
Blackford Safe Routes	We endorse the design as it stands, and as well as opposition, there are residents and businesses who very much support the design of the Quiet Route.	The support is noted.
General comments summarise d	allows more opportunities for neighbours and children to socialise and take part in unstructured play	
	quieter, more pleasant streets	

an active and healthier population	
easier to maintain social-distancing	
opportunities for placemaking, planters, benches, street trees	
and greenery	
safer means for children to get to school	
less isolation, more sociable streets	
clean air [even more important as air pollution has been shown	
to worsen outcomes from coronavirus infection]	
reduction in households exposed to dangerous levels of air pollution	
supports tackling the obesity crisis	
reduces traffic danger at source	
helps reduce short journeys by car that could easily be walked	
or cycled given safe and pleasant conditions	
reduces climate-breakdown causing emissions	
discourages drivers with no "social contract" to the area and	
the people who live there (local residents have greater reason	
to drive carefully)	
a gendered issue safe routes are particularly important to	
women and encourage more women to engage in active	
transport.	
To really make a difference to people's ability to use active travel, action needs to be taken fast. A try then modify	
approach would be excellent, and would allow the community	
to comment on the changes once they have experienced	
them, rather than responding to scare-mongering from	
(certain) councillors who will stop at nothing to make sure they	
have the right to drive their huge SUVs wherever they like,	
whenever they like.	
I think the one way measure on Braidburn Terrace is a good	
one.	
While the closure of Braid Road is clearly helpful as we live	
under the Covid-19 pandemic, the continued closure of this	

	road, together with the proposed Greenbank to Meadows Quiet route is important for the future by reducing pollution levels through traffic evaporation and giving the opportunity to improve health and well-being through safe, active travel.  The pandemic has changed the way we live and work forever and we must move with the times.  There is still a significant volume of private and commercial vehicles continuing to ignore the current closure to through motor traffic, which is not being effectively enforced. The consequence is that at school drop off and pick up times the narrow pavements are very crowded, making physical distancing all but impossible. Where families do use the 'closed' road space they are taking their lives in their hands. I note that in the revised plans there is a *existing* modal filter marked on Canaan Lane outside the Deanbank SMPS annex. Sadly no such filter exists in reality and until a physical barrier to through traffic is put in place the road is likely to continue to be used as a rat run, with consequences for our children and their families, as well as the viability of sections of the Quiet Route	
Public Comment against	70 emails objecting to the proposals – summary of main issues below	
	This is in inappropriate use of Emergency Powers to take forward a potentially important public health measure. It serves to discredit what is a very important public health intervention.	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.

Concerns about the huge number of changes being brought in under the guise of 'emergency measures'.	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.
If these are being promoted as emergency measures then why has it taken the council 9 months to make this proposal?	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.  The delivery of many projects over a short timeframe has presented challenging conditions for delivery and some projects have – naturally – taken longer to materialise than others. It is not possible to do everything at once.
Warrender Park Crescent is one way and may therefore be a special case. It makes our position particularly difficult. How are we supposed to approach if coming from, say Fountainbridge? Going to Blackford would entail a route through Tollcross or down Morningside Road. If we decide to try and park on Alvanley Terrace and find no spaces, how do we then reach Warrender Park Crescent?	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be

	introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
the Kilgraston Road junction is a notorious accident to sequally difficult to navigate for vehicles, pedestriant.  I live approximately equidistant between Canaan Lar Kilgraston Road. Your traffic proposals are removing access to my property from both Newbattle Terrace at Loan in addition to removing my egress via Canaan I given the speeding traffic conditions it is generally samy property from a westerly direction as opposed to Kilgraston Road junction.  I would suggest that restricting westbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to Road to "Residents only" would alleviate the "rat-runce and the suggest that restricting westbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to Road to "Residents only" would alleviate the "rat-runce and the suggest that restricting westbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound access to the Kilgraston Road junction as well as eastbound acces	Terrace, meaning a route to the west from Kilgraston will remain available.  Terrace, meaning a route to the west from Kilgraston will remain available.  Terrace, meaning a route to the west from Kilgraston will remain available.  Terrace, meaning a route to the west from Kilgraston will remain available.  Grange Loan at coess to Clinton theres.
Warrender Park Crescent is a one-way street and aff measures are introduced, residents' cars will only be by turning right into Whitehouse Loan so will therefor the heavy traffic on Bruntsfield Place. Getting back t will also involve a VERY long diversion as we will be the Whitehouse Loan/Warrender Park Road/Marchmand instead be forced to use Newbattle Terrace/Gran Loan/Marchmont Road/Warrender Park Terrace, an way round!	able exit WPC e be forced into o our homes unable to use ont Street route nge  Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from
We live in Warrender Park Crescent which is a one-variant from East to West. Under the proposals, we conorthwards out of our road and then, to return home, two mile journey via Bruntsfield Place, Churchhill, Standarchmont Road and Warrender Park Terrace. Or a would have one and a half mile detour via Home Street Melville Drive, Marchmont Road and Warrender Park As there are over a hundred homes in Warrender Park	Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed

will to do noth	needed for residents to go round and round in circles ing to help these quiet routes or the environment and neighbours elsewhere in Marchmont.	introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
particularly the coronavirus particularly the coronavirus particularly transport, make life r	eryone has the option of abandoning road transport, ose residents with mobility needs. During the andemic, everyone is discouraged from using public sing cars more essential. This quiet routes proposal much harder for Marchmont residents in general and Park Crescent residents in particular.	
For all the tho blocks betwee Road and Wa North-West, th - a very narrow	usands of residents who live in Marchmont in the on Whitehouse Loan, Marchmont Road, Thirlstane render Park Terrace, if they want to drive to the ney will be funnelled through Warrender Park Crescent of one-way street. Traffic through Warrender Park crease massively during the morning commute.	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
	ng the barrier just north of Warrender Park Crescent Varrender Park Crescent and Warrender Park Rd back	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Park Crescent Terrace and a	e might be to remove the barrier north of Warrender and add one at the west end of Warrender Park nother on Warrender Park Road between Marchmont uderdale Street.	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter,

That makes the block south of Warrender Park Crescent into a one-way roundabout.Residents can reach Warrender Park Crescent to park but there is no through-route.	between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Parents delivering children to Gillespies Primary could stop at the corner of Marchmont Street and Warrender Park Road. The parental school run is one of the major traffic problems in Marchmont.	Noted.
would just like to be clear about how your proposals would affect vehicular access to the section of Whitehouse Loan between Strathearn Place/Road and Bruntsfield Crescent. Are we correct in assuming that vehicles would be able to access 'our bit' of Whitehouse Loan from Strathearn Place/Road, Thirlestane Road and Greenhill Terrace; and that they'd be blocked just south of Bruntsfield Crescent?	Yes.
My main concern is increased volume of cars cutting across Braid Avenue and Nile Grove to go around the junction at the bottom of Morningside Road that is bound to be even busier than it is now with additional roads in the area closed.	We will monitor the situation in this area and consider any required revisions during the project review process.
Few neighbours seem to know about these proposals and at no point have the needs or opinions of people living on this street been canvassed	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.
Please push for meaningful consultation and an impact study to be carried out regarding these proposals.	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since

	lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.
Using current pandemic to rush through designs that would normally be consulted on in Non-COVID times	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.
Modal filters will lead to longer car journeys for some residents	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
These road closures will not give much benefit to cyclists, but will cause considerable difficulty for residents of the area, to access main roads iwithout queuing for long periods at light controlled junctions, or driving tortuous 'round the houses' routes, with consequent increased risks and pollution	It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be

	introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
Braid Avenue is wide enough for segregated cycling route	This is not currently proposed. However we will consider any required changes during the project review process.
To think you will get anyone other than dedicated cyclists doing it regularly in our winter months is naive and fanciful.	Many people continue to cycle throughout winter in Edinburgh already, and evidence shows that in cities which adopt cycling infrastructure the seasonality of cycling is decreased, with more people continuing to cycle throughout poor weather periods.
if modal filters are introduced on Whitehouse Loan, the volume of cars doing a U-turn at school pickups/drop-offs will likely increase causing a bottleneck potentially dangerous to children/pedestrians nearby	We will be monitoring the impact of these proposals and will respond to any issues as part of the review process.
Undemocratic to force these changes though without consultation	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.
I would also be very interested to know the legal basis for using these Covid 19 powers in this way.	The projects will be introduced through a TTRO notice in line with guidance from the Scottish Government.
The route is already quiet – there is no need for change	The aim of this project is to enable those who do not cycle, but would like to, especially in terms of children cycling to school. The need to interact with traffic is a key deterrent for more people cycling, which this project will address.
Cycle lane on Comiston Road prevents parking outside shops	This is not the case. Parking is still permitted by shops on the A702.
Will there be vehicular access to this stretch of Whitehouse Load from both Thirlestane Road and Greenhill Terrace? there are a number of premises that have street access onto this stretch of	There will still be access.

road, including the funeral directors and a number of houses. Part of our development (90-94 Whitehouse Loan) has a car park that is accessed from Whitehouse Loan immediately south of Brunsfield Crescent - how is access to this car park to be maintained?	
Will there be access for emergency services?	There will still be vehicular access to all properties along the route.
Will there be access for waste vehicles?	There will still be vehicular access to all properties along the route.
Will the closure result in the suspension of parking places in the affected stretch of Whitehouse Loan? Parking, particularly for residents is in short supply, and any reduction in spaces will have an adverse effect on residents and their visitors.	There will be minimal impact on parking.
Given the width of Whitehouse Loan, which until relatively recently was a bus route, might it be possible to consider a segregated cycleway as an alternative to closure of this section of road?	Segregated cycleways were considered, however there are numerous pinch points, and this would have required the removal of a large number of parking spaces.
Having only one route, Comiston Road, will lead to tailbacks, delays and awful air quality and pollution.	Traffic numbers, congestion and air quality are all subject to regular monitoring and will be considered as part of regular reviews.
Designated cycle lanes are a good thing, but road surfaces are appalling at present (Canaan Lane is treacherous) and these lanes can be made to work alongside vehicles.	Noted.
Residents will find getting to and from homes much more difficult, accessing the road network without Braid Road will be stressful and mean longer time sitting in the car, churning out fumes.	Braid Road is not part of these proposals.  It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
it is not realistic or fair at this time of rising COVID infection to expect commuters to increase their car sharing or use of public transport. Furthermore, this will have a disproportionate impact on lower skilled	This project aims to enable people to travel by bike for essential journeys, and exercise, especially for journeys to school, and the Astely Ainslee hospital. It is not

and key workers who are still travelling to work rather than those	expected to increase the umber of people car sharing or
who can work from home.	using Public Transport.
There's more danger to cyclists from pot holes and poor road surfaces than COVID-19	This project aims to enable people to travel by bike for essential journeys, and exercise, especially for journeys to school, and the Astely Ainslee hospital. It is especially
	important that these journeys can be made by foot or by bike while public transport capacity remains limited.
the introduction of double yellow lines and cycle lanes further south	Comiston Road is a separate scheme and subject to
on Comiston Road and apart from a singular absence of cyclists, the road markings are confusing to say the least with white line hatching in some places but with no signage or consistent message to	regular project reviews.
explain the regulations	
the current closure of Braid Road plus the one-way system in Braidburn Terrace, will contribute further to the traffic gridlock already being experienced at certain times of day on Comiston	Canaan Lane is not appropriate for use as a 'Vital Link Road'.
Road. In particular the closure of the top end of Canaan Lane to cars will remove a vital link road and force all Southbound vehicles out onto Comiston Road. This short one-way section of Canaan	The aim of this project is to enable those who do not cycle, but would like to, especially in terms of children cycling to school. The need to interact with traffic is a
Lane provides local drivers with a convenient route between the Grange and Morningside away from the bus route.	key deterrent for more people cycling, which this project will address.
I object to the closure of Canaan Lane to car traffic. This should not be needed in order to encourage cycling in this part of Edinburgh - cycle lane markings can be made and clear signage erected.	
Calls for Braid Road to be reopened	Braid Road is a separate project and is subject to
	regular project reviews.
The closure of Braid Road has created dreadful congestion on Comiston Road which leads to increased pollution outside South Morningside Primary School	Braid Road is a separate project and is subject to regular project reviews. Congestion and Air Quality are regularly monitored and form part of this review.
Emergency services will be delayed in accessing the area	Emergency services have been informed of the proposals and have not raised any concerns.
Reducing accessibility for motor vehicles disadvantages disabled	Vehicle access will be retained to all properties in the
and elderly residents who have difficulty using public transport	affected area. Many disabled and elderly people are unable to drive and will benefit from the removal of through traffic from these streets.
Traffic chaos caused by incidents or weather on surrounding roads	Traffic impacts will be monitored as part of the review
will be all the worse as traffic cannot take alternative routes	process.

Access to businesses on Comiston Road and in Morningside is much reduced, causing great harm to the local economy	Access to businesses is not affected by these proposals.
The constant congestion contributes to driver frustration and poor driving practices	These proposals are not expected to have a significant impact on congestion.
With some tweaking to the current plans, you could easily have Braid Road open and a cycle route. Traffic could be diverted one way and the cycle route another. At present the plan proposes to use Hermitage Gardens, Cluny Drive and Woodburn Terrace as part of the cycle route but traffic could flow, northbound & southbound, all the way along Braid Road without impacting on the majority of this space. This would only mean an extra bit of traffic management at the mini roundabout at the junction of Braidburn Terrace/Hermitage Drive/Braid Road and for a very short area along Hermitage Drive until the cycle way turns into Hermitage Gardens. However, I'm sure this can be managed with a priority cycle lane, traffic lights, single lane for vehicles etc. Yes this will cost more money, but in the long run will be more beneficial for more poeple, both those who wish to walk / cycle but it will also reduce the current levels of congestion on Comiston Road and outside Morningside Primary School	Braid Road is a separate project and is subject to regular project reviews.
they are totally unnecessary and again impact on disabled drivers getting around town.	Vehicle access will be retained to all properties in the affected area. Many disabled and elderly people are unable to drive and will benefit from the removal of through traffic from these streets.
<ul> <li>a) This entire route is already restricted to a 20 mph speed limit for all traffic, with 2 long sections of the route having added speed bumps, see b) and d) below.</li> <li>b) Speed bumps are on Whitehouse Loan from north of junction with Warrender Park Crescent ('No Entry') to north of junction with Greenhill Terrace, i.e. section includes street immediately outside the Gillespie's Schools.</li> <li>c) There is already a modal filter on Canaan Lane north of the Astley Ainslie hospital main entrance, i.e. 'No Entry' to north-bound vehicular traffic.</li> <li>d) There are also speed bumps on the section of the route from Canaan Lane (at Newbattle Terrace) through to the junction on Woodburn Terrace at Cluny Avenue.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>a) Noted</li> <li>b) Noted</li> <li>c) Noted</li> <li>d) Noted</li> <li>1) This filter is proposed to remove through traffic from Whitehouse Loan in order to provide a safe environment for less confident cyclists, including those cycling to school.</li> <li>2) (and 3 and 4) It is proposed to consolidate the modal filters across Whitehouse Loan from 3, down to two. Instead of a filter to the North of Warrender Park Road, and another to the South of Bruntsfield Crescent, there will be one filter, between these two</li> </ul>

	With reference to the attached map of the proposals:  1) The Royal Blind School is sited on Canaan Lane, NOT on Whitehouse Loan!  There is therefore no logical requirement for the proposed modal filter on Whitehouse Loan, immediately south of the junction with Strathearn Road, down to the junction with Grange Loan.  Clearly, this residential section of Whitehouse Loan is also so much wider than any of the other streets in the adjoining area.  2) The proposed modal filter on Whitehouse Loan, "immediately south of the junction with Bruntsfield Crescent", will close vehicular traffic access for residents from the south, into Bruntsfield Crescent, with a 'No Through Road' dead end there on Whitehouse Loan.  There will also be no vehicular traffic access for residents from the north, into Bruntsfield Crescent.  3) The proposed modal filter on Whitehouse Loan, "immediately north of the junction with Warrender Park Road", will close vehicular traffic access for residents wishing to turn left into Warrender Park Road from the north and with no right turn out of Warrender Park Road onto Whitehouse Loan towards Bruntsfield Place.  4) It therefore follows on from 3), that Whitehouse Loan from junction at Bruntsfield Place to the proposed modal filter immediately north of the junction with Warrender Park Road will become a 'No Through Road' dead end there since Warrender Park Crescent is already a 'No Entry'.	streets, in order to minimise impact on residents of Warrender Park Crescent and Bruntsfield Crescent, while still removing through traffic from Whitehouse Loan. This will be monitored and if needed further interventions on Warrender Park Road could be introduced to minimise through traffic on this street also as part of a scheme review.
	No consideration has been given to the right turns for cyclists going south a) from Hermitage Gardens on to Hermitage Drive, and b) from Braid Avenue on to Cluny Drive.	These streets are generally very quiet. However, should any issues arise these will be considered as part of regular project reviews and changes will be implemented.
Public Comment Neutral	45 emails asking for further consultation before measures are implemented.	
40 in total	Measures cannot be taken forward without further, in depth consultation with the affected residents.	On 14 May, the Policy and Sustainability Committee approved a package of suggested interventions to make it easier and safer for pedestrians and cyclists to move around the Capital. As well as providing extra space, the proposals recognise a rise in active travel since lockdown began and aim to facilitate this as the phased lifting of lockdown continues. These changes are being

	Is the TTRO legal given that there was a previous scheme?	delivered as part of the Council's Spaces for People programme. In line with guidance from the Scottish Government normal consultation procedures are not being carried out due to the need for expedient delivery.  These proposals have been developed specifically in response to the Covid-19 pandemic. Their similarity to previous ideas for development is not surprising as the need to provide safe routes for people to walk and cycle is an important part of the Council's response to the pandemic. It is also an important part of our overall transport strategy.
Dublic Com	ment In favour	
65 in total	This will open up new routes around the area and make cycling easier	The support is noted.
Commonpla	ce - Comments in favour of interventions on proposed route	
	Warrender Park Road – should be closed for access to school and to allow parents /carers to socially distance.	
	Whitehouse Loan – closure would allow children to access school as this is one of the primary walking route and suffers from severe rat running and speeding. Pavements should also be extended here as road is narrow. Parking spaces and guardrail opposite school wall should be removed making a direct and safe connection to the Links area	
	Astley Ainslie/Whitehouse Loan – many children use this route on bikes to get to school. There is no safe way to cross Whitehouse Loan – cars drive too fast and do not give way to cyclists.  Canaan Lane – improve road surface; extend pavements	
	Hermitage Drive; speeding drivers	