

ETROs South Edinburgh, [ETRO/21/29A](#), [/29B](#) [/29C](#) & [/29D](#)

Response from Spokes South Edinburgh, June 2025

Sent to edinburgh.consultation@projectcentre.co.uk

Spokes strongly supports the South Edinburgh ETROs and their significant contribution to encouraging people to walk, cycle and use public transport in the city. We have a number of suggestions, listed below, which we believe would make the projects even better.

General Comments

- Where lane defender units have been used in cycleways, efforts should be made to replace these with more permanent materials such as adhesive Scan kerbs as those already installed on Holyrood & Lasswade Roads. This both improves the visual appearance of the cycleway and provides a more continuous protected nature to the route.
- There are numerous instances across the scheme areas where cycleways have an unacceptably poor surface from their time as vehicle lanes. Given the width of many of the cycleways, this can cause acute issues for cyclists. Notably, those taking avoiding action may potentially strike a lane defender. The surface of all cycleways should be reviewed, and suitable resurfacing undertaken where required.
- There are numerous sections of cycleway where kerbside access is allowed and provided. Any instance of this, which forces cyclists to rejoin traffic, reduces the safety and attractiveness of the route and should be avoided where possible.
- The use of floating parking and loading bays, as well as relocating loading to side streets, has been successful in the city and should be used in further locations.
- None of the projects made any improvements for cyclists at junctions, which are known to be the most dangerous locations for cyclists. Future work should include measures such as:
 - Reduction in the number of traffic lanes at junctions, in order to provide cyclists with more space. This will also contribute to the city's plans to reduce car-kilometres by 30% by 2030.
 - Time-separation of cyclist and motor vehicle movements at junctions.
- Consideration in all projects should be given to users of non-standard cycles. For example, modal filters should be spaced widely enough that cargo cycles can be easily navigated through them, and turning radii of cycleways should be such that hand-cyclists can easily use them.
- The width of protected cycleways must not be less than 1.5 metres, and must not include the space taken up by kerbs or wands.

Detailed comments:

Spokes have the following detailed comments on the proposals;

ETRO/21/29A: South schemes

Buccleuch Street

1. The existing southbound advisory cycle lane between Gifford Park and Buccleuch Terrace should be retained since the protected cycleway is awkward to use if cycling north to south along Buccleuch St.
2. Double parking blocking the existing cycle lane on Lothian Street is often a problem, and consideration should be given to using a parking-protected cycle lane here.
3. The protected cycle lane should be extended on Teviot Place to meet Middle Meadow Walk. This would make it easier for cyclists approaching from Potterrow to proceed to Forrest Road by using the toucan crossing at the top of Middle Meadow Walk , and design of the layout should make it as clear as possible that such a manoeuvre is possible.
4. The protected cycle lane on Forrest Road should be reinstated.

Causewayside

1. We consider that the intermittent protected cycle lanes here do not work well. Instead, either continuous protected cycle lanes should be implemented or levels of through traffic should be reduced so that cycle lanes are not required. . A Bus gate or modal filter would reduce through traffic sufficiently and help increase cycle and public transport use along the corridor whilst still maintaining access to all section of the street for everyone. Given this route is paralleled by Minto Street / Craigmillar Park we see no reason why this should not be trialled.
2. The northbound advisory cycle lane on Ratcliffe Terrace has been a continual source of difficulty for cyclists since it was built. The cycle lane is frequently blocked by parked vehicles, which forces cyclists to move out into the flow of the traffic. Consideration should be given to replacing it with a parking-protected cycleway which would then continue into the protected cycle lane just south of Grange Loan.
3. The existing central feeder lanes at the Melville Drive and West Preston Street junctions feel dangerous to many cyclists. Banning left turns onto Melville Drive and West Preston Street would solve this (turning the filter lanes into segregated cycling lanes). The alternative route for motor traffic (via Nicolson Street) is a very short detour.

Craigmillar Road

1. Red screeding should be used to highlight advisory cycle lanes at junctions, particularly the East/West Mayfield junction.
2. At one point an advisory southbound cycle lane was proposed for the Craigmillar Park/Liberton Road junction, and we don't know why this wasn't implemented. This would discourage close passes from drivers in the junction.
3. Duncan St is currently one way for all traffic including cyclists. Although this may eventually be rectified by the proposals for a cycle route from Holyrood Park to Mayfield Rd, this will not happen for some time, if at all. As Duncan St is a major desire line for cyclists from Pollock Halls wishing to go east to west (against the one way street) we suggest that Duncan St contraflow cycling should be allowed, with some physical protection for cyclists crossing from Blacket Avenue at the entrance to Duncan St to

ensure that they do not conflict with west to east traffic wishing to turn right.

4. Liberton Road remains an important gap between the infrastructure on Craigmillar Park and Gilmerton Road. Measures for this stretch of road are required, especially to protect cyclists travelling south on Liberton Rd from motor traffic turning left on to Gilmerton Rd.

Gilmerton Road

1. Both cycle lanes where Gilmerton Road passes Double Hedges Road and Glenallan Drive are far too narrow, especially given the proximity to the traffic islands and the lack of protection. Close passes from drivers are a regular occurrence here. 3m wide cycle lanes, as at other pinch points in the proposals, would be more appropriate.
2. The scheme should be extended southwards, at least as far as Moredun Dykes Road, so that it can be used to get to Gilmerton Primary School.
3. The entrances to Morrisons and Aldi need particular attention in any new designs. Drivers frequently turn left across the cycle lane at these points without giving way to cyclists, who may be travelling quickly.

Mayfield Road

1. As with Causewayside, there is a serious need to reduce the amount of general traffic on the Mayfield Road / Potterrow corridor. The existing Causewayside and Buccleuch Street schemes are compromised by the parking bays which mean that the cycle lane protection is intermittent. Making these sections safe to cycle on therefore requires either making the protected cycle lanes continuous or reducing the levels of through traffic. Reducing through traffic might be achieved by adding a bus gate on Mayfield Road. The recent 18-month northbound closure of Mayfield Road at the Liberton Road junction shows that this, or similar measures, are possible.
2. The southbound cycle lane should extend all the way to the Liberton Brae junction, so that cyclists are able to safely reach the ASL at this junction.
3. Northbound cyclists going straight on at the King's Buildings junction need to move into the right hand lane, a manoeuvre which is often dangerous. We appreciate that the temporary nature of the scheme made it difficult to improve this, but it should be addressed in any permanent scheme.
4. The vast majority of crashes on Mayfield Road involving cyclists occur at the junctions – often when drivers are pulling out of a side street. Often drivers stop with the nose of their car in the cycle lane (particularly at Rankin Road, Lussielaw Road and Ross Gardens), forcing cyclists to veer into the main traffic lane to avoid them. More prominent red screed at these junctions should be applied, and the junctions could be changed from “Give Way” to “Stop”.
5. The parking bays at Margiotta's, near the West Savile Terrace junction, should be used to create parking-protected cycle lanes.
6. There is something odd going on with the speed limit signs on the side streets at the south end of Mayfield Road (Ross Road and parallel streets). Despite the speed limit on both Mayfield Road and the side streets being 20mph, there are signs at the entrance to each of the side streets. This is inconsistent with the way speed limit signs are used everywhere else and may cause confusion.
7. The cycle lanes at the traffic island near the junction with Max Born Crescent should be widened, as was done at the traffic islands at the north end of Gilmerton Road.

Old Dalkeith Road

1. The protected cycle lanes should extend further south, at least as far as Little France Drive, to meet Quiet Route 61.
2. The area around the Craigmillar Castle Road junction has a particularly poor safety record, and the red screed here should be renewed more regularly.
3. The northbound, uphill section of Old Dalkeith Road between Little France Crescent and Kingston Avenue is a blackspot for close passes, and more protection here would be very helpful (leaving only a gap for the bus stop).
4. The right turn filter lane at Craigmillar Castle Road could be removed to provide space for a wider northbound segregated cycle lane.
5. Right turns into Craigmillar Castle Road could be banned, or the road closed altogether (with exceptions for cyclists and emergency services).
6. Southbound segregation should be extended closer to the Craigmillar Castle Road junction.
7. The new island at the Craigmillar Castle Road junction works well and should be made permanent. Further radii tightening, to slow turning traffic, should be considered.
8. Drivers frequently cut into the cycle lanes outside and opposite 128-140 Old Dalkeith Road. Protection must be continued here.
9. We were pleased that the chicane on the path behind Bridgend Farmhouse was widened, but it should still be replaced with a bollard.
10. The ASL lead-in at the Cameron Toll junction should be extended back to the bus lane. Removing the two "diverging arrows" where the bus lane ends, and extending the ASL to meet the bus lane would discourage drivers from cutting in on cyclists.

ETRO/21/29B: Braid Rd

Fundamentally since Northbound motor vehicle traffic was reinstated on Braid Rd in 2023, Spokes SE are still concerned that there is now a greater presence of intrusive motor traffic and some drivers' only aim to reach the Braid Road exit onto Cluny Avenue. It is clear that this is having a tangible impact on the progress of walkers, wheelers & cyclists through the Braid Estate. Also these plans need to be seen in the context of the yet to be implemented unnecessary changes to the 'Braid Estate';

Spokes SE has the following detailed comments;

1. The addition of planters as a modal filter has made the left turn onto Braid Road from Braidburn Ter very easy for cyclists, and because there are no following vehicles, the section down to Braid Crescent is much more pleasant. This modal filter should be retained.
2. Cyclists heading West are heading directly into the narrowed (one way) mouth of Braidburn Terrace with the risk of having to wait in the path of other vehicles negotiating the junction, or heading into oncoming traffic.
3. Heading straight through the modal filter planters onto Braid Road southwards is fine at the moment because low traffic presents lots of gaps but is unlikely to be safe when numbers increase as induced demand studies prove the present easing of congestion will be followed by more motor vehicles overtime.
4. The new geometry of the road at the Hermitage Drive junction mouth is generally causing cars to slow right down, which is a good thing but it is making drivers more aware of each other and less aware of cyclists.
5. The placement of the parallel zebras are of most use for pedestrians and are not especially intuitive for cyclists. The cycle crossing indicated is blocked by cars stopped at

- the pedestrian crossing point. The arrangement of temporary crossing signage and temporary traffic signals means the delineated cycle area is partially inaccessible.
6. Alternative ways to negotiate or perhaps now avoid the junction for cyclists heading South or West need to be explored. For example, Westbound from Braid Road, could be managed by right turn into Braidburn Crescent / Greenbank Place to arrive in the middle of Braidburn Terrace, but signage would have to change and traffic levels monitored. This should also include a high level study as to why the right turn northbound into Braidburn Terrace is retained given that Braid Rd is now open in both directions.

ETRO/21/29C: Comiston Rd

Summary

Waiting and loading restrictions on Comiston Road (also called Pentland Terrace and Buckstone Terrace as it heads South). Generally these seem to be added in sensible places where drivers might misuse a gap in the segregation poles but they are often abused without any apparent penalties. On uphill stretches, in particular, the speed difference between cycles and vehicles makes it unsafe for a cyclist to enter the road lane, overtake a parked vehicle and return to the cycle lane. There are places along the route where these are regularly abused. We would like to see clearer signposting of the various floating parking areas and, where appropriate, clearly signed loading space on side roads.

The current ETRO does not offer solutions for problems at the two most dangerous sections of the road: at the Braid Hills Road junction and at the parking bay at the Buckstone shops. Further comments on these sections are below.

Waiting/Parking restrictions. The double yellow blips are faded in a number of places and are very difficult to distinguish from the green and yellow weeds growing in gutters and the edge of pavements.

Work vehicles (gardeners, landscapers, tree surgeons & builders etc) use these spaces for work commissioned by householders on the A702. Could householders be provided with information to give to business owners they employ advising on suitable places near their house where unloading and parking could take place legally. This might include loading space on nearby side roads.

1. Comiston Roads/ Braid Hills Road junction

No changes are proposed to the most dangerous junction with Braid Hills Road, which is a busy junction with traffic turning in from both directions on Comiston Road as well as turning right from Braid Hills Road onto Comiston Road. This places the cyclist at risk of a left hook, and a sideways hit from two directions. The safest position for a cyclist in this junction is to be in the middle of the red lane marked on the road, by exiting through the segregation poles to prevent cars from overtaking at the narrow point at the pedestrian crossing island.

This must have been the intention of the placement of the red lane. However the slower speed of an uphill cyclist and the 30 mph uphill pace drivers make this a tricky exit and most drivers do not slow to let a cyclist out here. Better signage is needed to ensure drivers slow to allow cyclists out. Ultimately the problem could be resolved by moving the island so that the road is not narrowed so close to the junction.

2. Buckstone shops layby

No changes appear to be offered to improve parking infringements at the Buckstone shops. The disabled spot is regularly abused, and double parking, or cars parking half in / half out of the bay is common. Fairly frequently southbound drivers cross two lanes to park in the layby facing the 'wrong' way. This means when they leave they have to sit across the northbound (downhill) cycle lane before they can see traffic heading downhill towards them. Spokes would welcome measures to address these concerns.

ETRO/21/29D: Meadows to Greenbank Quiet Route

Spokes South Edinburgh strongly supports the retention of the Meadows to Greenbank Quiet Route along the route it currently takes. The proposals in ETRO/21/29D of the areas of modal filters on Whitehouse Loan, Canaan Lane, Cluny Drive and Braid Avenue are all successful.

Spokes SE would like the add comments on the following;

- Addition of give way signage and 'caution cycles' signage at the junction of Cluny Drive at the west side of Braid Avenue on approach to the modal filter. There is currently a give way marking on the road but no triangular signs.
- We would like the addition of wayfinding signage throughout the area to provide a unified appearance with the wider Quiet Route 'network'.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, Spokes South Edinburgh would like to reiterate support for the principle of the South ETROs as a whole.

However this is caveated by concerns about the detailed design at and around key points, and we trust these will be given full consideration prior to finalising the proposal.